

Central Saanich - Site Options Comparison Table (5 max, 0 min pre-weighting) Low, Medium, High Weight

Project Objectives Evaluation					
Evaluation Criteria	Weight (H=3, M=2, L=1)	1903 Mt Newton X Rd New	1903 Mt Newton X Rd Reno/Exp	Hovey Road	Criteria Evaluation Comments
OCP Fundamental Principle: Support Agriculture AND Maintain Rural Character					
Prioritize development within the Urban Containment Area	3	5.0 15.0	5.0 15.0	5.0 15.0	All Options: Both sites are within the Urban Containment Area.
Potential to provide on-site area for agricultural use (ex: Community Food Production Hub & Demonstration Garden)	1	3.0 3.0	2.3 2.3	3.0 3.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Site is quite limited in terms of site area for hard and soft landscape treatments. The site will be taken up by internal roads, sidewalks and surface parking. The remainder of the site will be developed by a future developer. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Site is quite limited in terms of site area for hard and soft landscape treatments. The site will be taken up by internal roads, sidewalks and surface parking. Hovey Road: Site is quite limited in terms of site area for hard and soft landscape treatments. The site will be taken up by internal roads, sidewalks and surface parking. Potential relationship with Centennial Park.
Subtotal		18.0	17.3	18.0	
OCP Fundamental Principle: Use Limited Land Supply Wisely AND Manage Growth Carefully					
Support a balanced approach to growth on-site (ex: municipal site not overbuilt, potential areas for future expansion identified)	2	2.7 5.3	2.3 4.7	3.3 6.7	1903 Mt Newton - New: Building includes additional internal growth space with no potential expansion space. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Building includes additional internal growth space with the addition of extra storage room. Hovey Road: Building includes additional internal growth space with some potential expansion space.
Provide new, purpose-built facilities to support future service provision and workstyles	2	4.7 9.3	4.3 8.7	5.0 10.0	All Options: All facilities are new or major renovations and meet or exceed program area requirements.
Support synergies between functional groups to streamline operations and increase efficiency	3	5.0 15.0	3.3 10.0	5.0 15.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: All components are consolidated in one building. Functional groups are on one floor. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: All components are consolidated in one building. Functional groups are on two floors. Hovey Road: All components are consolidated in one building. Functional groups are on one floor.
Reflects highest and best use of land with respect to the market feasibility	3	3.3 10.0	0.0 0.0	5.0 15.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Half of 1903 Mt Newton Cross Rd site value increases if rezoned for mixed-use development vs current use. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: No additional land available for other development. Hovey Road: Creates a municipal precinct on currently underutilized land on Hovey. 1903 Mt Newton Cross Rd site value increases if rezoned for mixed-use development vs current use.
Allow for flexibility in phased construction and minimizes disruption to ongoing operations during redevelopment, especially for Police & Fire Services (ex: minimizes need for swing space, number of temporary moves)	2	4.0 8.0	1.7 3.3	5.0 10.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Allows for full construction of new municipal facilities on site with minimal disruption to current operations at 1903 Mt Newton X Rd. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Site requires phased construction as existing functions are being relocated on the same site. Anticipate some disruption during construction. Hovey Road: Allows for full construction of new municipal facilities on site without disruption to current operations at 1903 Mt Newton X Rd.
Achieve synergies with surrounding property uses (ex: access/links to neighbourhood amenities)	3	4.7 14.0	1.7 5.0	5.0 15.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Potential to integrate the municipal services within a future mixed use development, incorporating amenities. Existing commercial centre amenities adjacent. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: No potential to integrate the municipal services within a future mixed use development, incorporating amenities. Existing commercial centre amenities adjacent. Hovey Road: Strong potential to create relationship with Centennial Park, destination location for the public. Freed up existing site to align with OCP, Strategic Priorities, and Saanichton Village Design Plan.
Subtotal		71.7	41.7	79.7	
OCP Fundamental Principle: Support Economic Development AND Provide a Range of Housing Opportunities					
Use compact footprints for Municipal services to make space available for other uses on site, without compromising the functionality of the Municipal services. Provide a range of housing opportunities.	3	3.7 11.0	0.0 0.0	5.0 15.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Municipal functions are stacked in a 2 storey building with underground parkade, using approx 50% of the site. Makes additional land available for other development including housing. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Footprint of building is large and no additional land available for other development. Hovey Road: Municipal functions are stacked in a 2-3 storey building with underground parkade, using approx 50% of the site. Makes 1903 Mt Newton fully available for other development including housing.
Subtotal		11.0	0.0	15.0	
OCP Fundamental Principle: Facilitate a Sense of Community					
Support easy access to public services (ex: close to residential centre)	2	5.0 10.0	5.0 10.0	4.0 8.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Site is close to central mixed use development. Consolidates primary public municipal functions together (Municipal Hall, Police, Fire) 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Site is close to central mixed use development. Consolidates primary public municipal functions together (Municipal Hall, Police, Fire) Hovey Road: Associated with both Saanichton and Brentwood Bay residential area and adjacent to existing public amenity space (Centennial Park). Consolidates primary public municipal functions together (Municipal Hall, Police, Fire).
Provide exterior space for community use on site, such as open plaza space and park/play areas, to promote health/wellbeing and community connection.	2	4.0 8.0	0.3 0.7	5.0 10.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Site is quite limited in terms of site area for hard and soft landscape treatments. Park/community use space potential with mixed use development on site. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Site is quite limited in terms of site area for hard and soft landscape treatments. Hovey Road: Area available at front of site with potential relationship with Centennial Park.
Create an active, pedestrian scaled, street frontage	2	3.7 7.3	1.7 3.3	4.0 8.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: 2-3 storey structure with one facade facing Mt Newton Cross Road to create potential active zone with improved street frontage/sidewalks. Parking is below ground or along street frontage. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: All surface parking around building visible from Wallace Drive. Sidewalk along Wallace and pedestrian access within site. Hovey Road: 2-3 storey building is set back from the street, prioritizing green space adjacent to street frontage, some surface parking in front and back of building visible from Wallace Drive. Allows for full site development of 1903 Mount Newton, creating better opportunity for smart design.
Support intuitive wayfinding in the organization of the site (ex: zoning public use to front of site, considering sightlines, placemaking markers)	3	3.7 11.0	3.7 11.0	5.0 15.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Building is not as prominent in position on overall site as other options, but building itself can support intuitive wayfinding. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Hovey Rd site: Building location is prominent on site and can support intuitive wayfinding. Hovey Road: Building location is prominent on site and can support intuitive wayfinding. Central location to all residential nodes. Centennial is "Community Park" destination.
Ensure the site is accessible and inclusive for all	3	5.0 15.0	4.3 13.0	5.0 15.0	All Options: All sites will support access and inclusion.
Reflect a "good neighbour" approach to the organization of the site with respect to the surrounding area to minimize negative impacts: consider access points to site, visual sight-lines into the sites, noise transfer etc.	3	3.0 9.0	3.7 11.0	4.0 12.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Fire Station #2 fronts single family residential across street with limited opportunities to buffer due to vehicle access. Facility set against neighbouring residential property. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Existing functions remain in place, familiar to neighbourhood. Hovey Road: Access points available off Wallace Drive and Hovey Rd reduce potential impact to either street. Brings new functions to the neighbourhood on previous vacant, but not-accessible land.
Subtotal		60.3	49.0	68.0	

Evaluation Criteria	Weight (H=3, M=2, L=1)	1903 Mt Newton X Rd New	1903 Mt Newton X Rd Reno/Exp	Hovey Road	Criteria Evaluation Comments
OCP Fundamental Principle: Create Walkable Neighbourhoods					
Support the design "Green and Pedestrian Friendly Streets" (wider sidewalks, bike lanes, integrated trees and landscaping) that prioritize pedestrians and cyclists.	2	1.3	0.0	1.7	1903 Mount Newton - NEW: has the ability to create walkable streets by incorporating into design principles. Flexibility of design lessened due to Phase 1 build of municipal hall. 1903 Mount Newton - Reno/Exp: Decreases walkability due to expansion of footprint of current building. Hovey Road: Significant opportunity to prioritize pedestrians and cyclists on 1903 Mount Newton. Bike Lane access to Hovey from Saanichton and Brentwood Bay, Pedestrian sidewalks from Saanichton.
		2.7	0.0	3.3	
Create new pedestrian cross connections across the site or retain and enhance existing pedestrian paths across the site.	2	5.0	3.3	5.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Existing pedestrian path at site can be partially retained and re-routed to reflect new site development.
		10.0	6.7	10.0	1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Existing pedestrian path at site can be retained. Potential to be enhanced. Hovey Road: Potential for pathways around municipal portion of site.
Employ Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) principles in site organization and building forms: sightlines/overlook	3	5.0	3.0	5.0	All Options: All sites have the potential to support CPTED principles; however, the renovation does not change the building configuration (large expansive building creates lack of visibility from street).
		15.0	9.0	15.0	
Subtotal		27.7	15.7	28.3	

OCP Fundamental Principle: Protect and Enhance the Environment, Biodiversity & Natural Ecosystems AND					
Enhance the Urban Tree Forest and create urban habitat to support biodiversity	2	4.0	2.0	5.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Site is quite limited in terms of site area to support trees/urban habitat. Potential with mixed use development on site. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Site is quite limited in terms of site area to support trees/urban habitat. Hovey Road: Larger area available at front of site, adjacent to Centennial Park, that could support trees/urban habitat.
		8.0	4.0	10.0	
Employ blue-green solutions and natural systems (ex: rain gardens, bioswales, permeable paving) to address stormwater management on site	3	1.3	0.7	1.7	All Options: All sites have the potential to support blue-green solutions and natural systems, however, they do not currently incorporate.
		4.0	2.0	5.0	
Subtotal		12.0	6.0	15.0	

OCP Fundamental Principle: Address the causes and impacts of Climate Change					
Implement passive design strategies for building massing, orientation and location to minimize energy demands. Support applicable BC Energy Step Code level (4) identified by District for new construction post 2025	3	4.0	2.0	4.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Building shape and size is optimal for energy efficiency. Orientation would be preferred in a more East-West line (long elevations facing north and south). Potential to introduce natural ventilation for municipal hall on upper levels. Due to their complexity, the Fire Station and Police Services are a challenge to implement passive design strategies. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Building massing is not optimal for energy efficiency. Passive design strategies are not being considered. Hovey Road: Building shape and size is optimal for energy efficiency. Potential to introduce natural ventilation for municipal hall on upper levels. Due to their complexity, the Fire Station and Police Services are a challenge to implement passive design strategies.
		12.0	6.0	12.0	
Support cost effective on-site energy generation and storage, such as solar PV and geothermal.	2	1.3	1.3	1.3	All Options: All sites have the potential to support on-site energy generation, however, they do not currently incorporate.
		2.7	2.7	2.7	
Support post disaster response, in particular for Police and Fire.	3	5.0	4.0	5.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Facility will be constructed to post-disaster standards. With the integration of building systems, the whole building will be constructed to post-disaster standards. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: The Police and Fire building will be constructed to post-disaster standards. The civic building will be constructed for seismic safety but not to post-disaster standards. Hovey Road: Facility will be constructed to post-disaster standards. With the integration of building systems, the whole building will be constructed to post-disaster standards.
		15.0	12.0	15.0	
Encourage alternative modes of transportation including walking, cycling and public transportation (ex: proximity to public transport)	3	4.0	4.0	3.7	1903 Mt Newton - New: Mt Newton Cross Rd site: Adjacent to bus stops at Wallace Drive as well as Saanichton Exchange. Existing roadside pedestrian facilities along Wallace Drive and Mt Newton X Rd. Wallace Drive and Mt Newton X Rd identified for cycling improvements, provisions for bike storage/shower/changing facilities on site. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Same comment as new build. Hovey Road: Adjacent to bus stop at Wallace Drive/Hovey Rd. Existing and future planned roadside pedestrian facilities on Wallace Drive. Access to trails/paths in Centennial Park. Wallace Drive identified for cycling improvements, provisions for bike storage/shower/changing facilities on site.
		12.0	12.0	11.0	
Subtotal		41.7	32.7	40.7	
Project Objectives: Grand Total		242.3	162.3	264.7	

General Characteristics Evaluation					
Financial					
Construction cost	3	4.0	5.0	4.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: 2nd most expensive construction cost option. Same as Hovey 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Least expensive construction cost option. Hovey Road: 2nd most expensive construction cost option. Same as 1903 - New.
		12.0	15.0	12.0	
Construction time + Project time	3	3.0	0.0	3.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Construction timeline: No complications due to phasing or access on site. Project timeline: 18-24 months. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Phased construction required resulting in potentially longer overall timeline for construction. Project timeline: 36-48 months. Hovey Road: Construction timeline: No complications due to phasing or access on site. Project timeline: 18-24 months.
		9.0	0.0	9.0	
Re-location costs	3	3.0	3.0	3.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Move required for Police Services, Fire Station #2 and Municipal Hall from current building to new building. Museum relocation. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Temporary structures and associated relocation costs required for Fire Station #2. Council Chambers to temporarily move offsite. Potential for civic employees to move offsite. Hovey Road: Move required for Police Services, Fire Station #2 and Municipal Hall from 1903 Mt Newton site to Hovey Rd Site. Museum relocation.
		9.0	9.0	9.0	
Reuse of existing buildings and infrastructure where applicable	1	0.0	4.3	0.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: None/limited 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Existing facility will be renovated. Some major equipment will be repurposed. Hovey Road: None/limited
		0.0	4.3	0.0	
Affect on existing infrastructure	2	5.0	5.0	5.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: No major affects anticipated. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: No major affects anticipated. Hovey Road: No major affects anticipated.
		10.0	10.0	10.0	
Real estate (Sale & Purchase Costs)	3	2.7	0.3	4.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: No sites required to be purchased, potential to sell off half of 1903 Mt Newton X Rd for revenue to fund project after rezoning is completed. Annual tax revenue. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: No sites required to be purchased. Hovey Road: Requires purchase of Hovey Road site, however cost is offset by sale of 1903 Mt Newton Cross Road site which is valued significantly higher after rezoning is completed. Annual tax revenue.
		8.0	1.0	12.0	
Subtotal		48.0	39.3	52.0	

Evaluation Criteria	Weight (H=3, M=2, L=1)	1903 Mt Newton X Rd New	1903 Mt Newton X Rd Reno/Exp	Hovey Road	Criteria Evaluation Comments
Effectiveness					
Alignment with current zoning	1	4.2	5.0	1.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Aligned 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Aligned Hovey Road: Requires rezoning of site
Operational Site Access and internal site circulation is efficient and effective for all use types (fleet vehicle, passenger vehicle, bike, pedestrian)	2	3.0	3.3	4.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Access to site is limited to just Mt Newton Cross Rd with potential access from Wallace with development. Some cross over circulation between public, staff and fleet vehicles. Police and Fire fleet vehicles have separate access. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Includes ring circulation around the building, with access to site from Mt Newton Cross Rd and Wallace. Some cross over circulation between public, staff and fleet vehicles. Police and Fire fleet vehicle have shared access. Hovey Road: Potential site access from multiple locations on Wallace Drive and Hovey Road. Public/small vehicle circulation is separated from Police and Fire fleet vehicle circulation.
Site plan supports workflow/functionality and improves service delivery (ex: integrated service counter model)	3	5.0	3.0	5.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Vertical stacking of components creates efficiency, consolidated service counter provided. Simple site circulation flow supports safety and efficiency. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Horizontal locations of components. Multiple service counters and inefficient circulation flow. Significant impact on municipal operations with construction and renovation lasting up to six years with at least one temporary relocation of staff. Hovey Road: Vertical stacking of components creates efficiency, consolidated service counter provided. Simple site circulation flow supports safety and efficiency.
Programmatic fit (site accommodates full program including projected growth for Municipal facilities)	2	5.0	5.0	5.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Building includes additional internal growth space with no potential expansion space. This building could be designed to have additional floors added. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Hovey Site: Building includes additional internal growth space with the addition of extra storage room. Additional floors could be added above Police and Fire but not on original building footprint Hovey Road: Hovey Site: Building includes additional internal growth space with no potential expansion space. This building could be designed to have an additional floor added.
User preference	3	2.0	2.5	3.0	1903 Mt Newton - New: Connectivity, relationship to surrounding development, village centre location, potential synergy with future mixed use development. 1903 Mt Newton - Reno/Exp: Connectivity, relationship to surrounding development, village centre location. Not best use of land and provides no additional amenity including housing. Police and Fire have expressed equal preference to both sites. Hovey Road: Site is within the UC boundary, potential connection to Centennial Park, reflecting best use of the land at Hovey, freeing up full 1903 Mt Newton Cross Road site, site is central and well connected, but challenge of lack of infrastructure and other public amenities/services in area.
Subtotal		41.2	38.2	43.0	
General Characteristics : Grand Total		89.2	77.5	95.0	
Project Objectives + General Characteristics GRAND TOTAL		331.5	239.8	359.7	